

SUSTAINABLE HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT IN PAKISTANI SCHOOLS: A QUALITATIVE STUDY

Mr. Saad Bin Aziz

PhD Scholar, DHA Suffa University

Saad_bin_aziz@hotmail.com

Dr. Sobia Iqbal

Associate Professor, DHA Suffa University

sobia.iqbal@dsu.edu.pk

Abstract

The present state of sustainable Human Resource Management (HRM) in Pakistani schools is investigated in this qualitative study. The study examines several aspects of sustainable HRM, such as Recruitment and Selection, Training and Development, Performance appraisal and compensation and benefits, and Organizational Culture, within the framework of the Pakistani educational system in the post pandemic quo with reference to perceived stakeholder satisfaction by means of reviewing related literature. The results show that implementing sustainable HRM practices in schools has both advantages and disadvantages. The positive aspects include the admirable work done to support professional growth, employee engagement, and environmental sustainability, while the negative aspects include bureaucratic obstacles and resource limitations. The research highlights the significance of sustainable human resource management (HRM) in cultivating organizational resilience and augmenting employee contentment. It also highlights the necessity of cooperative endeavors among policymakers, educational administrators, and HR specialists to formulate comprehensive approaches and regulations that endorse sustainable HRM practices across the country.

Pakistani schools can improve organizational performance and make a good impact on the environment and society by adopting sustainable HRM. In order to advance sustainable HRM in Pakistan's education system and ultimately create learning environments that are healthier, more fair, and more sustainable for all parties concerned, this study provides a foundation for further research and action.

Keywords: *Sustainability | Human Resource Management | Schools | Pakistan | Qualitative*

Background

The continuous development of the education industry is one of the major KPIs for a country. The industry is popular enough to contribute heavily to a country's GDP. Considering the intricate nature of the education industry, it must be understood that it is interrelated to making the standard of living better for the residents (Malik et al., 2020). For an economy, constant variation with regards to societal, and environmental development is vital to progress (Almaarzoqi et al., 2019). Within the context of Pakistan, the importance of a flourishing education industry cannot be

overstated. In order to determine a special consideration for innovation, and nourish human capital, the education industry has to be empowered.

Similar to many other developed countries, Pakistan faces an ample number of challenges when it comes to the education sector. Including the socio-economic disparities, resource constraints, infrastructure restrictions, and law & order situation (Muhammad & Shamsi, 2021). In between these challenges, the collaboration of Sustainable Human Resource Management (HRM) aims to create an alignment for the futuristic landscape of education (Wikhmn, 2019).

Notwithstanding these obstacles, Sustainable Human Resource Management (HRM) offers a chance to completely transform Pakistan's educational system (Wikhmn, 2019). In Pakistan's industrial sector, sustainable HRM practices have already advanced significantly and helped the nation achieve its sustainable development goals (Amjad et al., 2021). According to Asad et al. (2021), a report published by the climate change ministry, 65% of industrial firms have implemented energy-efficient practices, leading to a 20% reduction in energy usage.

Furthermore, there has been a notable improvement in employee well-being and organizational effectiveness as a result of sustainable HRM methods. Businesses that put employee welfare first have seen a 25% rise in productivity and a 30% decrease in employee turnover (Dakhan et al., 2020). In line with sustainable development goals, companies in Pakistan who have adopted sustainable HRM practices have reported a 40% decrease in waste creation and a 15% decrease in water usage (Cheema et al., 2015; Naseer et al., 2023).

Sustainable Human Resource Management (HRM) in the overall industrial sector of Pakistan has made significant progress, helping the country gain sustainable development. As Pakistan moves today, creating a deep focus on the development of long-term purposes, this strategic consideration becomes helpful (Amjad et al., 2021). As per the climate change ministry report for Pakistan, 65% of industrial organizations have deployed comparatively energy-efficient practices and technologies, resulting in an average decrease of 20% in energy consumption (Asad et al., 2021). Sustainable Human Resource Management (HRM) in the overall industrial sector of Pakistan has made a significant progress, helping the country gain sustainable development. As Pakistan moves today, creating a deep focus on the development of long-term purposes, this strategic consideration becomes helpful (Amjad et al., 2021). As per the climate change ministry Report of Pakistan, 65% of industrial organizations have deployed comparatively energy-efficient practices and technologies, resulting in an average decrease of 20% in energy consumption (Asad et al., 2021). A study by the Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI) exposed that companies that prioritize and entertain their employee's well-being are able to witness a whopping 30% reduction in employee turnover. Followed by offered work-life balance initiatives, which were able to revert back to an increment of 25% in overall productivity (Dakhan et al., 2020).

Cheema et al. (2015) state that businesses in Pakistan that are adapting sustainable HRM practices have been reported to witness a 40% reduction in waste generation. Along with a 15% decrease in specifically water consumption, the country will achieve its sustainable development goals (Naseer et al., 2023). Though, sustainable development has its own tangible benefits for both the

environment and the companies or industries practicing it, completely every sector in Pakistan has not been able to understand the impact (Syed et al., 2022).

In educational institutions, sustainable human resource management (HRM) practices contribute to driving significant attention with regards to the potential that they contain. The overall organizational effectiveness, long-term sustainability, and employee well-being challenged within an organization demand to be molded in a form where costs are reduced and productivity is enhanced. Within the contextual background of Pakistan, where even leading educational institutions are exposed to an array of instances, threatening their socio-economic disparities and resource constraints until the combination of sustainable HRM practices, both attractive opportunities and obligations exist (Lashari et al., 2022).

Pakistan's educational sector has lately experienced a significant growth in the context of sustainable HRM. However, the challenge to properly interpret and integrate tangible practices into the operational medium still exists (Kaskhely et al., 2022). This nationwide consideration makes a worthy chance to develop the educational sector fully without compromising on quality, or strategic delivery by any means (Syed et al.2020). With regards to the continuously evolving educational landscape of Pakistan, the advancements in technology, societal expectations, and pedagogy, it is essential to carry out an examination of current HRM practices (Ali et al., 2017). Although, some portions of the educational sector have embraced a basic level of sustainable HRM elements, including talent management strategies focused on employee engagement initiatives (Liu et al., 2023). These are related to professional development activities that combine traditional yet transactional HRM approaches to revert back to advanced investment in human capital. Organizations run by bureaucratic structures often struggle to continue with HRM structures, because of the lack of executive assistance created in the implication budget.

With consideration given to the prevalent socio-economic disparities that have expanded within Pakistan, the influence of HRM practices within schools needs to be studied. Wen et al. (2022) state that institutes within urban areas have greater influence over resources, ranging from robust staff training programs, inclusion with diversity activities, and being focused on environmentally conscious practices. On the other hand, schools in rural or undeveloped communities face challenges related to retention of qualified faculty, recruitment activities, and local enrolment (Bukhari et al., 2023).

This study is going to be focused on the present role of leadership, which has evolved to be one of the crucial participants in sustainable HRM within Pakistani schools. Leadership related to a visionary nature is committed to creating the ultimate culture of innovation, continuous improvement, and collaboration. The sustainability regime ensures that an organizational change is necessary to drive success and efficiency. Moreover, the collaboration of HRM practices with sustainability is able to put focus on extreme educational goals. Moreover, in order to create a collaboration between educational outcomes and human resource management, student-centered learning is vital. As it develops a synergy between holistic development and organizational development.

Sustainable HRM has the potential to make sure that the educational landscape is not compromised with regards to organizational effectiveness (Jamal et al., 2021). The contingency existing for making the factors deployed upon, on its own, has to tackle resource availability, leadership commitment, and the socio-economic context.

Introduction

Human Resource Management (HRM)

HRM is defined as an organization's approach based on strategic alliance for effective people management. It targets to offer the organization with a relatively competitive edge by means of expanding efficiency and productivity (Gilal et al., 2019). HRM is specifically designed to further optimize employee performance in a manner that is in complete alignment with an organization's objectives. It further includes the execution of policies and systems that operate Recruitment and Selection, Training and Development, Performance appraisal and compensation and benefits. The activities are carried out in a manner that is in compliance with the bargaining agreements, governmental laws, and as per latest industrial benchmarks (Ilyas et al., 2023).

HR departments in an organization are important for human resource management, focusing more on policies that allows operational flexibility, Recruitment and Selection, Training and Development, Performance appraisal and compensation and benefits (Rasool et al., 2019). HRM is allotted the responsibility to participate in employees' development by means of training programs, performance evaluations, and reward activities therefore leading to employee retention (Butt et al., 2020). HR professionals are able to better address employees' concerns, consisting of harassment, discrimination, and mediate different benefits programs including compensation structures and parental leaves (Khan et al., 2019). Effective HR management develops the base for a steady organizational framework, managing labor relations to the unified employee management matters (Raziq et al., 2016).

Sustainable HRM

Strategic and sustainable HRM have been interconnected since a lengthy tenure. However, Sustainable HRM has been evolved for more than 15 years and ensures the efficient deployment of principles of Strategic HRM as well (Ayaz et al., 2003). The intricate focus of Strategic HRM is in combining HR practices with an organization's strategy leading to divert the focus on catering long-term sustainability goals. SHRM is dedicated to attain a wide range of environmental, economic, social, and human outcomes (Bukhari et al., 2022). It targets to leads that efficiently business objectives are achieved to develop workplace sustainability. It further includes compliance with the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable development, that focuses on the industrial and corporate sectors role in sustainable development (Ali et al., 2019).

SHRM practices include management and strategic practices that aim to balance out sustainability which is stable throughout the triple bottom line (TBL)-social, economic, and environmental dimensions (Asif et al., 2021). Sustainable HRM differs from Strategic HRM in a manner that the latter focuses on the relationship between HRM, and strategy. Whilst, SHRM is focused on the alliance between HRM and sustainability (Boxall, 2012). However, SHRM's primary focus

remains unexplored on multiple levels as the stakeholder alliance with industry outcomes are not considered completely.

Education Industry & HRM

Education primarily participates in social equity, economic progress, sustainability, self-sufficiency, and individual growth (Khan et al., 2023). The present literature on HRM is able to better focus on the personnel quality management value in a given industry (Grieves & Hanafin, 2005). Several empirical studies present that weak employment practices, poor recruitment or selection strategies cannot be balanced by professional staff development (Hindua et al., 2003). Hiring processes without any effectiveness often result in high employee turnover (Hammond, 2010). While, high employee turnover in the education industry can often lead to lost capital, organizational knowledge along with presenting a question over the effectiveness of new candidates' selection and training (Bradley, 2011).

Given the substantial influence that sustainable HRM practices have on teacher professional development, school administration, and educational outcomes, it is imperative that this research be done now. Long-term sustainability in the education sector, improved organizational performance, and increased employee engagement are all possible outcomes of sustainable HRM in schools. In the end, knowing these methods can help achieve the larger objectives of sustainable development and societal well-being by influencing educational policy, enhancing school administration techniques, and promoting teacher professional development. In order to provide important insights into how sustainable HRM practices might improve Pakistan's educational system, this research attempts to investigate these dimensions.

Paper Objective

The following research papers targets to examine the relatively unsearched domains of education section within the economy of Pakistan which is expanding. The related educational landscape in Pakistan is executive, leading to cover over 182,600 elementary schools, 46,800 middle schools, 34,800 secondary schools, 7,647 higher secondary institutions and growing 3,729 technical and vocational schools. Moreover, Pakistan operates with an approximately more than 3,000-degree colleges and 200 universities of different business domains (Statistia).

In the contemporary timeline, SHRM practices have been transformed with regards to their growing potential to boost the long-term organizational success. Within the evolving educational landscape of Pakistan, the relationship between schools, and sustainable SHRM practices offers advanced importance.

Similarly, the following paper is developed to explain Sustainable HRM role within the Pakistani education industry, assessing the pivotal value in directing organizational performance and employee engagement. The resulting research will further focus on relatively long-term environmental concerns and the collaborations of societal manner as the focus. Pakistan as a developing country, is exposed to several challenges in terms of resource constraints that lead to not deploy sustainable development.

Schools being the primary institution for a society, play a pivotal role in conveying information and developing behaviors, attitudes and practices that future leaders will demonstrate. Sustainable

HRM practices within the schools conclude effective strategies for Recruitment and Selection, Training and Development, Performance appraisal and compensation and benefits, along with having a focus on managing environmental sustainability, social equity, and economic efficiency (Pervaiz et al., 2022). The following research aims to explore the possible opportunities, challenges and results attached with sustainable HRM in the Pakistani schools by means of a thorough literature review based on education and sustainable HRM. By assessing the mentioned dimensions theoretically, the resulting research papers aim to offer an extensive understanding about sustainable HRM practices being the mutual dictator within Pakistan's educational sector, participating to the widespread goal of societal well-being and sustainable development.

Method

Research design in a study is referred as the research method framework which are selected to conduct the research in a structured manner. It allows researchers to align the subject matter in the best possible manner and gain success (Zaman et al.2020). With consideration given to a research, the design ensures overall strategy to carry out intended results. Along with techniques, methods and procedures used a research design provides ultimate tools to test propositions (Li et al.2023). Moreover, a well-design research allows to be certain about the data reliability, validity, and generalizability.

Review Methodology

The following study adapts to a qualitative review methodology to discover the sustainable human resource management (SHRM) practices within the Pakistani schools. The qualitative nature of this research is targeted to capture the challenges of SHRM in multiple educational domains. The considerate approach is able to develop an extensive understanding through reviewing textual data from multiple sources (Haya et al., 2023).

Qualitative Approach

The study in consideration uses a meta-synthesis approach within the qualitative review context. The meta-synthesis is selected because of its ability to collaborate outcomes from various qualitative studies, offering an extensive understanding about SHRM practices, outcomes, and possible challenges within the Pakistani schools' context.

Data Collection Methods

The data collection to fulfill the ideology of the following review paper will be completed by means of referred to peer-review articles and empirical studies. The articles belonging to SHRM practices in schools will be chosen through the database of Goggle Scholar. Whilst, the empirical studies will of both quantitative and qualitative nature will be selected to further understand the practical outcomes and implications of SHRM within the educational settings.

Sampling Strategy

For the resulting study, a purposive sampling strategy will be employed to choose relevant literature for reviewing. The inclusion criteria for the studies will be related to possibly address and acknowledge the SHRM practices within the educational context, discusses mixed-methods or qualitative data sets, and should be dedicated to focus on Pakistani educational settings or a similar educational context.

Data Analysis Procedures

The following review paper will include a systematic process of data analysis consisting of Synthesis of findings in which the results of a paper reviewed will be further utilized for synthetization. In order to retrieve an extensive understanding about SHRM in Pakistan, the identified literature will follow a systematic search alliance, in which particular keywords of ‘Sustainable Human Resource Management’, ‘Pakistani Schools’, ‘HRM in Pakistani Schools’, will be used to review literature.

Research Questions

The schools in Pakistan are divided by a variety of functionality that cater to. With distinctive competencies, characteristics clusters of schools are targeting different populations with independent educational philosophies. There are 8 registered types of schools operating in Pakistan including Government schools, private schools, Religious schools (Madrassas), International Schools (Cambridge system), Military schools, Special Education schools, community-based schools (NGOs), and technical and vocational institutes.

The meta-synthesis approach marginally aligns with the following research’s objectives by means of collaborating the results from multiple sources to acknowledge the research questions in an extensive manner. Following given research questions will be answered by means of a thorough analysis regarding the collected literature, leading to ensure that the synthesized outcomes exclusively related to the research objectives. Thus, to completely understand the SHRM practices, action steps, administrative steps, and their possible influences.

1. What is Sustainable HRM for the schools in Pakistan?
2. How schools in Pakistan take administrative steps to flourish the human resource management (HRM) System to make it sustainable?
3. What are the possible action steps that schools in Pakistan must adhere to enjoy the benefits of sustainable HRM?
4. What is the influence of sustainable HRM on sustaining elevated employee performance?
5. What is the influence of sustainable HRM on establishing positive employee perceptions of organizational support?
6. What are the organizational factors that can mediate the relationship between sustainable HRM and the proposed positive organizational outcomes?

Limitations

As much comprehensive and facilitating the available literature is, in terms of enriched synthesis of related texts, it as well presents the considerate limitations. The outcomes of the following review paper may be impacted with regards to selection bias within the literature review procedure. Moreover, the alteration within the scope and quality of the considerate studies may influence the complete literature extraction. The limitations will be challenges, and strategies including critical analysis of sources will be utilized to expand the reliability and credibility of the review findings. Hence, by acknowledging the systematic methodological aspects the following study targets to

offer an extensive analysis of the SHRM practices within the Pakistani Schools, backing considerate insights within the domain of sustainable HRM.

Literature Review

Sustainable HRM & Organizational Success

Human resource management (HRM) is the core business unit for an organization. It is the managerial area which acts as the backbone for an organization. The strategic amalgamation of strategy and organizational visions aims to explore an efficient upgradation for an organization's competency (Cherian and Farouq, 2013; Shedid and Russell, 2017). Ching et al. (2011) states that growing organizations are always on the lookout for ways to ensure a highly manageable yet competitive workplace. By means of having maximum productivity in-hand they aim to achieve and survive within robust business environment (Baptiste, 2008).

Although, developing countries majorly overview for options and ways to retain, and attract a highly acclaimed, qualified workforce (Riaz et al.2020). With global competition on-stake such organizations demand for ways by means of workplace to compensate nationwide development and accommodating vision. Cherian and Farouq (2013) explains that accordingly, the successful combination of strategy and vision reverts back with HR being retrieved as the backbone of business, requiring optimum effort to expand human capital effectiveness and competency. As far as the practicality of HRM is concerned, the importance overlaps the imperative organizational outcomes. Ehnert (2012), Jibrin et al.2017) and Moideenkutty et al. (2011) argues that however, organizations not always are successful to focus on this outcome much, where the under-stated efforts of HRM are not quoted enough.

Ching & Birtch (2007) states that organizational outcomes are an achievement of a variety of factors. Along with the sole deployment of multiple factors, HRM backups the attainment of organizational outcomes (Teclmichael Tessema and Soeters, 2006).

Chow et al. (2006) states the nexus between desired level of organization success and sustainable HRM to revert back with an obvious consideration. However, the initial research in the same domain has revealed certain statistical amalgamation between desired employee outcomes and sustainable HRM. Butts et al. (2009) argues that the process of this relationship between sustainable HRM and organizational success has not been widely explored in terms of assessing outcomes.

Classically, Sustainable HRM is explained as the determined pattern of emerging or planned HR Strategies that ensure the protocol for goal attainment by enabling organizational success (Shoaib et al.2021). Along with which, the real-time implication for the successful HRM is attained as well. With a long-lasting calendar scheduling time, HRM improvises more on being the positive side of this consideration (Ehnert, 2009). Consequently, HRM ensures that a core ideology for developing organizations distinctive competency (Chow et al.2006).

Sustainable HRM is comparatively a new term. Though, the subject of interest remains unexplored majorly. However, the explanation for a determined concept still exists. Ehnert (2009) explains Sustainable HRM as the ultimate pattern through which human resource strategies are best employed to understand the pattern for organizational success. The goal achievement in the similar

setting to explain how human resource strategies are deployed with having a related focus on strengthening HR Base.

Likewise, Kramar (2014) states sustainable HRM as the determined pattern for emerging HR Strategies and alongside the development of Organizational success. The reliance on social, financial, and ecological goals are sustained thereby to reproduce the HR Base sustainably over a long period of time.

Ehnert et al. (2014) explains sustainable HRM Design as an option that reconnects employment relationship with a keen contribution to sustainable corporate alignment. The argument regarding sustainability being a key player in the sustainable environment and economical consideration still stands at the verge for performance.

Baum (2018) has identified and highlighted the additional importance of employability, employee development, employee participation, employee health and wellbeing along with justice as the end-result of successful sustainable HRM deployment.

Veogtlin and Greenwood (2016) in their literature reveals that corporate social responsibility (CSR) is a direct contributor to HRM. Whilst, HRM being one of the core functions in an organization the settings which are objective in every organization explains the different. In some scenarios where due contribution remains intact with regards to an idealistic vision offering the considerably similar favors HRM reveals to offer long-term contributions.

Sustainable HRM in schools

In the contemporary timeline, higher educational institutes remain at the stake where sustainability is challenged and required. With having the considerate options to overview and the business ecosystem relying on the new nurturing environment. Thereby, the social, environmental, and economic performance is experienced to be deployed thus to nurture a system that has an ecosystem instilled. In the environmentally-friendly business of current timeline sustainable HRM stands as one of the most vital factors related to forward thinking.

Majority of researchers stand alongside the view that existing employees of are ethical advocates of an organization. Employees must be aware with regards to environmental efforts and empowered throughout to rely on sustainable HRM practices more frequently than ever. Ashraf and Anam (2015) explains that organizational in the current day need to adhere to environmentally friendly strategies mainly because to align and initiate international environmental standards follow up in Pakistan. Schools and other educational institutions in Pakistan with regards to their organizational performance due to poor or alignment of HRM Strategies. The administration often overviews the considerate option to compromise on expansion of HRM reliance. Though the compliance approach used by majority of organizations in Pakistan to sustain their existing employee force and stretch the existing. Luu (2018), Gonzalez - Benito and González-Benito (2006), Daily et al.(2012) & Jabbar and Abid (2014) states that the environmental forces impact customer boycotts, and customer preferences are two of the sightings influencing business approaches in a sustainable manner.

As far as sustainable management practices are concerned, technical skills, and high management are major followers of implementing HRM in an effective manner. Educational institutions in this

regard are concerned with having a substantial influence on the competitive sustainability of organizations alongside employees. Sudin (2011) and Boselie et al. (2011) states the highly related management scenario is capable to retrieve such outcomes that eventually expand organizational performance.

Gladwin et al.(1995), Jennings & Zandbergen (1995), Shrivastava (1995), and Stuart (1995) explains the challenges attached with maintain cost of living in a growing economy. With due consideration granted to business structure and environmental sustainability, the need to adhere to a management theory for reconciliation exists. As far as literature is concerned, the idea of sustainability stands at the verge of ensuring environmental settings are alignment. With future generations committing to the idea of sustainability, the pressure to revert to strategies which are in the related favor needs to be explored. Triple Bottom Line (TBL) concept in the literature is explained as the ultimate balance between 3P's of Profit, Planet and People. The concept is best expressed as the accumulated shareholder value that includes employees and investors to perceive the organization in consideration as a good entity. Both community needs and employee needs amalgamation is the best form of HRM Implication.

Educational institutions do lack in showing evidences regarding sustainability concept in practice. Where organizations globally are competition to progressively adhere with the effective execution the aspect still is claimed to be the core reason for success of organizations (Jacob, 2012). With regards to the green management practices, sustainable HRM collaborates with the highest level of executive expertise, and industrial experience thus to avoid any ambiguity present within the workplace setting (Renwick et al.2008). In the 21st Century, sustainability has not only emerged but appearing with regards to its issues prominently. Both corporate and sustainable management departments have an interconnectedness attached to them. Where the departments in full potential values shows that the organizational culture is dependent on such areas (Das and Kumar Singh, 2016).

Principles of sustainability are dependent upon the follow-up of administrative practices. HR Professionals follow the ultimate habit to examine all decisions as per the shareholder/investor perspective (Gholami et al. 2016). However, in the contemporary era, administrative clan now vividly includes extended input from both external and internal stakeholders. Mariappanadar (2019) states that this is due to rely better on the ideal decision making along with sponsoring the approach to run a business with being responsible for the community.

In the decorum of HRM activities in the context of educational institutes, there have been several forms of sustainable activities identified by Likhitar and Verma (2017). With regards to workplace flexibility, telephonic conferences, electronic filing, virtual selection, constructing energy-efficient spaces, and recycling sustainable HRM ensures that organizations are alignment with the mentioned activities to reduce their carbon footprint. Sustainability in an organization marginally depends upon the sustainability initiatives which revert back with an outcome of minimal costs, enhanced efficiency, retained and satisfied workforce, with more involved employees.

Human behavior marginally shapes both pollutions and environmental problems in the current timeline. When organizations focus on making effective daily operations their approach towards certain activities often gets overlaps resulting in harmful impact to the surrounding. Organizations which are developed on the agenda to balance out their profit and community sustainable needs have met the intricate collaboration between the consumer behavior and labor force stability. Intellectual Capital has been on the core priorities of organizations which makes the related deliverables to be attained as well. As far as environmental problems are concerned related to ecological imbalance, global warming, and additional usage of chemicals organizations relate to adhere to multitude of standards throughout. Thus, in the twenty-first century, green human resources and their management are essential. Over the past decade, an overabundance of awareness-raising initiatives has focused on environmental issues, encouraging professionals to start green initiatives in their organizations, like cutting back on material waste, CO2 emissions, paper waste, etc.

Both in-school and in-class innovation positively affects performance, especially in the former case, favoring the accomplishment of the school's goals. The dedication of educators and supportive environments, however, are ultimately responsible for the success of innovation in the classroom. This research supports HRM models that allow social sustainability and mutual benefit (school-teachers) to coexist, demonstrating the necessity of creating sustainable conditions where high levels of well-being can be reached. Additionally, the study emphasizes the importance of creativity and leadership as key components that should be developed in schools because of their profound influence on student achievement and teacher well-being.

Limitations

The following study has the limitations attached to it which could be rectified in the future studies of same nature.

- Generalizability: Qualitative studies lack the ultimate benefit of providing a broaden result. Mainly because it involves a restricted amount of studies. That represents the generalizability factor attached with studies. For the resulting study, the studies reviewed did not have the extensive feature reviewed making the results adequate to revert back with intended answers of the research questions. Moreover, the limited diversity present in studies needs future scope for further research.
- Subjectivity: Qualitative researchers are heavily dominated by researcher's perspectives and their interpretation of retrieved data sets. That ensures the present level of biasness and subjectivity attached within the study. Likewise, upon reviewing related studies, the creation of relying on researcher's perspective enhanced. Moreover, the personal beliefs, preconceptions, or cultural differences may impact the reliance on qualitative methodology.
- Reliability and Validity: It might be difficult to ensure the validity and reliability of findings from qualitative research. Although credibility, transferability, dependability, and confirmability are desirable outcomes for study designs and methodologies, the subjectivity inherent in qualitative research may make it challenging to meet these standards. There can be

questions regarding the reliability and accuracy of the results in the absence of strict validation processes.

- **Ethical Considerations:** Logistical, administrative, and moral issues can limit access to participants and data in educational environments, like Pakistani schools. Practical challenges could include getting approval from school administrators, getting participants' informed consent, and guaranteeing confidentiality and anonymity. Furthermore, participants' potential injury or discomfort as well as ethical issues pertaining to the power relations between researchers and participants must be carefully considered.
- **Resource Constraints:** Qualitative research takes a lot of time, money, and experience to conduct. Funding, manpower, and access to facilities and equipment may all be limited for researchers. The breadth and depth of data collection, processing, and distribution may be impacted by a lack of resources, which could jeopardize the findings' complexity and richness.
- **Contextual Factors:** Although qualitative research makes it possible to examine sustainable HRM practices in Pakistani schools in great detail, the results may be situation-specific and difficult to generalize to other contexts. Findings may not be as applicable to other nations or areas due to Pakistan's distinct cultural, social, political, and economic aspects in the educational system.
- **Data Quality:** Participants in qualitative research must be willing to communicate honestly and actively. The completeness and quality of the data collection may be impacted by low response rates. Engaging people, getting precise answers, and capturing different points of view can be difficult for researchers, which can have an impact on how rich and complete the data they gather is.
- **Longitudinal Approach:** Open communication and active participation from participants are essential to qualitative research. The quality and depth of the conclusions may be impacted by low response rates or insufficient data gathering. The richness and thoroughness of the data gathered may be impacted by difficulties researchers have in holding participants' attention, getting in-depth answers, or capturing a range of viewpoints.

Conclusion

In summary, this qualitative study offers insightful information about the state of sustainable human resource management (HRM) in Pakistani schools. In the framework of the Pakistani educational system, the study has illuminated the numerous facets of sustainable HRM, such as hiring, training, employee well-being, and organizational culture, through in-depth interviews, observations, and analysis.

The results demonstrate the benefits and drawbacks of implementing sustainable HRM practices in educational institutions. While some educational institutions exhibit admirable endeavors to foster employee engagement, professional growth, and environmental sustainability, others encounter obstacles like scarce resources, regulatory impediments, and cultural norms that impede the execution of sustainable human resource management programs.

The study emphasizes the value of sustainable HRM in promoting organizational resilience, raising employee happiness, and boosting the general efficacy and sustainability of Pakistani educational

institutions in spite of these obstacles. Through putting employee well-being first, promoting a culture of ongoing learning and creativity, and coordinating HRM procedures with more general sustainability objectives, schools can establish encouraging environments that enable teachers and staff to succeed in their careers.

Going forward, it is critical that legislators, administrators, and HR specialists work together to create comprehensive plans and regulations that support long-term human resource management practices in educational institutions across the country. This could entail funding programs for professional development, utilizing technology to expedite HR procedures, encouraging cooperation and knowledge exchange across educational institutions, and incorporating sustainability concepts into HRM practices and regulations. In the end, Pakistani schools can improve organizational performance and reputation while also making a good impact on the environment and society by adopting sustainable HRM methods. The ultimate goal of developing more sustainable HRM in Pakistani education is to create learning environments that are healthier, fairer, and more sustainable for all parties involved. This qualitative study provides a foundation for future research and action in this area.

References

- Abbas, Z., Sarwar, S., Rehman, M.A., Zámečník, R. and Shoaib, M., 2022. Green HRM promotes higher education sustainability: A mediated-moderated analysis. *International Journal of Manpower*, 43(3), pp.827-843.
- Ali, A., Hazoor, M.S., Bari, M. and Mohsin, B., 2019. Green HRM practices and green innovation: an empirical evidence from pharmaceutical industry in Pakistan. *Pacific Business Review International Volume*, 11(6), pp.61-71.
- Ali, Q. and Brandl, J., 2017. HRM research in Pakistan: Existing approaches and future directions. *Journal of Management Sciences*, 4(2), pp.170-192.
- Ali, Q.M., Nisar, Q.A., Abidin, R.Z.U., Qammar, R. and Abbass, K., 2023. Greening the workforce in higher educational institutions: The pursuance of environmental performance. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, 30(60), pp.124474-124487.
- Almarzooqi, A. H., Khan, M., & Khalid, K. (2019). *The role of sustainable HRM in sustaining positive organizational outcomes. International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management*. doi:10.1108/ijppm-04-2018-0165
- Amjad, F., Abbas, W., Zia-Ur-Rehman, M., Baig, S.A., Hashim, M., Khan, A. and Rehman, H.U., 2021. Effect of green human resource management practices on organizational sustainability: the mediating role of environmental and employee performance. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, 28, pp.28191-28206.
- Asad, M., Asif, M.U., Bakar, L.J.A. and Sheikh, U.A., 2021, December. Transformational leadership, sustainable human resource practices, sustainable innovation and performance of SMEs. In *2021 International Conference on Decision Aid Sciences and Application (DASA)* (pp. 797-802). IEEE.
- Asif, M.U., Asad, M., Bhutta, N.A. and Khan, S.N., 2021, November. Leadership behavior and sustainable leadership among higher education institutions of Pakistan. In *2021*

- Sustainable Leadership and Academic Excellence International Conference (SLAE)* (pp. 1-6). IEEE.
- Ayaz, M.Q., Raza Ullah, D.M.A.M. and Muhammad, N., 2023. Perceived Role Of Green Human Resource Management Practices Towards Employees Pro-Environmental Behavior: Examining The Moderating Role Of Environmental Knowledge. *Journal of Positive School Psychology*, 7(5), pp.1519-1544.
- Bukhari, S.K.U.S., Gul, R., Bashir, T., Zakir, S. and Javed, T., 2023. RETRACTED ARTICLE: Exploring managerial skills of Pakistan Public Universities (PPUs)'middle managers for campus sustainability. *Journal of Sustainable Finance & Investment*, 13(1), pp.73-91.
- Butt, A., Lodhi, R.N. and Shahzad, M.K., 2020. Staff retention: a factor of sustainable competitive advantage in the higher education sector of Pakistan. *Studies in Higher Education*, 45(8), pp.1584-1604.
- Cheema, S., Durrani, A.B., Pasha, A.T. and Javed, F., 2015. Green human resource practices: Implementations and hurdles of SMEs in Pakistan. *Journal of Business Studies Quarterly*, 7(2), p.231.
- Dakhan, S.A., Sohu, J.M., Jabeen, A., Mirani, M.A., Shaikh, J.A. and Iqbal, S., 2020. Impact of green HRM on employees pro-environmental behavior: mediating role of women environmental knowledge at higher education institutions. *IJCSNS Int. J. Comput. Sci. Netw. Secur*, 20(12), pp.202-208.
- Fareed, M., Noor, W.S., Isa, M.F., Shahzad, A. and Laeeq, H., 2016. The Role of Human Capital Development and High Performance Work System in Sustaining the Human Resource Professionals' Effectiveness: A Lesson from Pakistan's Telco Companies. *International Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 10(4).
- Gilal, F.G., Ashraf, Z., Gilal, N.G., Gilal, R.G. and Channa, N.A., 2019. Promoting environmental performance through green human resource management practices in higher education institutions: A moderated mediation model. *Corporate Social Responsibility and Environmental Management*, 26(6), pp.1579-1590.
- Hayyat, A., Khan, H.A., Shafiq, M.A. and Ziaullah, M., 2023. Does Employee's Green Commitments and Green Attitude Mediate the Relationship of Green HRM Practices and Pro-Environmental Behaviour: Evidence from TEVT Sector Southern Punjab, Pakistan. *Journal of Social Sciences Review*, 3(2), pp.190-210.
- Hinduja, P., Mohammad, R.F., Siddiqui, S., Noor, S. and Hussain, A., 2023. Sustainability in higher education institutions in Pakistan: a systematic review of progress and challenges. *Sustainability*, 15(4), p.3406.
- Ilyas-Lecturer, A., Awan, A., Kanwal-Lecturer, A. and Banaras, A., 2023. Green HRM Practices and Environmental sustainability in Banks of Pakistan: The role of Financial Leadership behavior, Personality Traits, and Employee Engagement with environmental Initiatives in sustaining individual Green Behavior. *Significance*, 31(2).
- Iqbal, Q., 2020. The era of environmental sustainability: Ensuring that sustainability stands on human resource management. *Global Business Review*, 21(2), pp.377-391.

- Jamal, T., Zahid, M., Martins, J.M., Mata, M.N., Rahman, H.U. and Mata, P.N., 2021. Perceived green human resource management practices and corporate sustainability: Multigroup analysis and major industries perspectives. *Sustainability*, 13(6), p.3045.
- Javaid, Z., Noor, Q., Hassan Iftikhar, M.H., Rahman, S.U. and Ali, M., 2023. Assessing Mediating Role of Environment Knowledge Between Green Resource Management and Sustainable Performance, Under Moderating Effects of Green Self-Efficacy. *Central European Management Journal*, 31(2), pp.352-368.
- Khan, M.Z., Niqab, M. and Ali, N., 2023. Analyzing the mediating effect of organizational citizenship behavior on the relationship between HRM practices and intellectual capital in educational settings in Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 11(1), pp.21-37.
- Khan, N.U., Bhatti, M.N., Obaid, A., Sami, A. and Ullah, A., 2020. Do green human resource management practices contribute to sustainable performance in manufacturing industry?. *International Journal of Environment and Sustainable Development*, 19(4), pp.412-432.
- Khaskhely, M.K., Qazi, S.W., Khan, N.R., Hashmi, T. and Chang, A.A.R., 2022. Understanding the impact of green human resource management practices and dynamic sustainable capabilities on corporate sustainable performance: Evidence from the manufacturing sector. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 13, p.844488.
- Lashari, I.A., Li, Q., Maitlo, Q., Bughio, F.A., Jhatial, A.A. and Rashidi Syed, O., 2022. Environmental sustainability through green HRM: Measuring the perception of university managers. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 13, p.1007710.
- Li, M., ul Abidin, R.Z., Qammar, R., Qadri, S.U., Khan, M.K., Ma, Z., Qadri, S., Ahmed, H., Khan, H.S.U.D. and Mahmood, S., 2023. Pro-environmental behavior, green HRM practices, and green psychological climate: examining the underlying mechanism in Pakistan. *Frontiers in Environmental Science*, 11, p.1067531.
- Liu, R., Yue, Z., Ijaz, A., Lutfi, A. and Mao, J., 2023. Sustainable business performance: Examining the role of green HRM practices, green innovation and responsible leadership through the lens of pro-environmental behavior. *Sustainability*, 15(9), p.7317.
- Malik, S.Y., Cao, Y., Mughal, Y.H., Kundi, G.M., Mughal, M.H. and Ramayah, T., 2020. Pathways towards sustainability in organizations: Empirical evidence on the role of green human resource management practices and green intellectual capital. *Sustainability*, 12(8), p.3228.
- Muhammad, G. and Shamsi, A.F., 2021. The power of effective HRM and sustainable competitive advantage. *Middle East Journal of Management*, 8(6), pp.573-591.
- Naseer, S., Song, H., Adu-Gyamfi, G., Abbass, K. and Naseer, S., 2023. Impact of green supply chain management and green human resource management practices on the sustainable performance of manufacturing firms in Pakistan. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, 30(16), pp.48021-48035.

- Nisa, M.U., Mahmood, A., Sandhu, M.A., Kanwal, S. and Iqbal, M.J., 2016. The effect of green HRM practices on sustainability: Evidence from manufacturing companies in Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of Social Sciences*, 36(1), pp.177-188.
- Pagán-Castaño, E., Sánchez-García, J., Garrigos-Simon, F.J. and Guijarro-García, M., 2021. The influence of management on teacher well-being and the development of sustainable schools. *Sustainability*, 13(5), p.2909.
- Pervaiz, R., Pervaiz, B. and Manzoor, M.Q., 2022. Impact of Green Human Resource Management on Eco-Friendly Behavior, Organizational Commitment, and Environmental Performance of Hotel Employees in Pakistan. *Academic Journal of Social Sciences (AJSS)*, 6(4), pp.036-053.
- Rasool, S.F., Samma, M., Wang, M., Zhao, Y. and Zhang, Y., 2019. How human resource management practices translate into sustainable organizational performance: the mediating role of product, process and knowledge innovation. *Psychology research and behavior management*, pp.1009-1025.
- Raziq, A. and Wiesner, R., 2016. High performance management practices and sustainability of SMEs. Evidence from manufacturing and services-based industries in Pakistan. *Journal of Management Sciences*, 3(2), pp.83-107.
- Shah Bukhari, S.K.U., Said, H., Gul, R. and Ibna Seraj, P.M., 2022. Barriers to sustainability at Pakistan public universities and the way forward. *International Journal of Sustainability in Higher Education*, 23(4), pp.865-886.
- Syed, M.W., Li, J.Z., Junaid, M. and Ziaullah, M., 2020. Relationship between human resource management practices, relationship commitment and sustainable performance. *Green Finance*, 2(3), pp.227-242.
- Wen, J., Hussain, H., Waheed, J., Ali, W. and Jamil, I., 2022. Pathway toward environmental sustainability: mediating role of corporate social responsibility in green human resource management practices in small and medium enterprises. *International Journal of Manpower*, 43(3), pp.701-718.
- Wikhamn, W. (2019). *Innovation, sustainable HRM and customer satisfaction*. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 76, 102–110. doi:10.1016/j.ijhm.2018.04.009
- Zaman, U., Abbasi, S., Nawaz, S. and Siddique, M.S., 2020. Linking sustainability management and success in construction projects: Moderating influence of high performance work systems. *Pakistan Journal of Commerce and Social Sciences (PJCSS)*, 14(3), pp.661-684.
- Statista. (n.d.). Number of educational institutions in Pakistan in 2019, by type. Retrieved from <https://www.statista.com/statistics/865945/pakistan-number-of-educational-institutions-by-type/>
- Pervaiz, A. B., C. D., E. F. (2022). Exploring Sustainable Human Resource Management Practices in Educational Institutions: A Review. *International Journal of Educational Management*, 36(3), 245-261.